The O'Connell Street Precinct O'Connell, Bent and Spring Streets, Sydney

> Planning Proposal Statement of Heritage Impact

> > Prepared for Lendlease

February 2024 • Issue B Project number CMJ 604

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Background and purpose of the report	1
1.2	Methodology and terminology	1
1.3	Author identification	1
1.4	Site location and description	1
1.5	Overview of the proposal	2
1.6	Documentation	4
1.7	Heritage management context	5
2	19-21 O'CONNELL STREET CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN 2022	10
2.1	Historical overview	10
2.2	Heritage significance	21
2.3	Principles and Policies	21
2.4	Settings and views	28
3	HISTORY AND SIGNIFICANCE OF 1-15 O'CONNELL STREET	32
3.1	Overview history	32
3.2	Statement of Significance	34
4	DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSAL	36
4.1	Background	36
4.2	Overview of the Proposal	36
4.3	The Reference Design	37
5	ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT	38
5.1	Introduction	38
5.2	Assessment of heritage impact on 19-21 O'Connell Street	38
5.3	Assessment of heritage impact on The Wintergarden 1-15 O'Connell Street	40
5.4	Assessment of heritage impact on the Radisson Hotel 66 Pitt Street	41
5.5	Assessment of heritage impact on the adjacent heritage sites	43
6	CONCLUSIONS	44

Issue	Date	Purpose	Written	Approved
P1	30 August 2022	First Draft	CMJ	CMJ
P2	25 October 2022	Final Draft for client review	CMJ	CMJ
P3	28 October 2022	Revised Final Draft for team review	CMJ	CMJ
A	8 November 2022	Final for submission to Council	CMJ	CMJ
В	17 February 2024	Final for Planning Proposal submission		

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background and purpose of the report

This Statement of Heritage Impact assesses the impact of the proposal on the cultural significance of the buildings within and adjacent to the site. It supports a Request for a Planning Proposal to amend the *Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012* (Sydney LEP) and the Sydney Development Control Plan 2012 (Sydney DCP 2012) in relation to the O'Connell Street Precinct and is submitted to the City of Sydney Council (Council) on behalf of the Proponent.

This report should be read in conjunction with all supporting material associated with the Request for a Planning Proposal and DCP amendment, including the Planning Justification Report prepared by Ethos Urban.

1.2 Methodology and terminology

This report follows the general guidelines for Statements of Heritage Impact, set out in the NSW Heritage Manual, Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs and Planning (1996).

The report adopts the terminology defined in the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter, 2013 for the conservation and management of places of cultural significance in Australia.

1.3 Author identification

This document was Megan Jones, Architect and Principal of Michael E + C Megan Jones Pty Ltd trading as Megan Jones Architect. It draws on information from the Conservation Management Plan for 19-21 O'Connell Street prepared in 2022 by Megan Jones Architect with contributions from Dr Roy Lumby and Dr Sue Rosen, architectural historians.

Megan has over 40 years' experience in the provision of architectural and heritage architectural services for the conservation and adaptive re-use of heritage buildings and sites and the preparation of heritage assessments and heritage planning documents for heritage buildings and sites.

1.4 Site location and description

The O'Connell Street Precinct is located within the City of Sydney Local Government Area (LGA). The precinct is within the north-eastern portion of the Sydney CBD and is in immediate proximity to existing public transport infrastructure and a diverse mix of business, retail, cultural and entertainment destinations. The Precinct is also strategically located adjacent to the future Hunter Street metro station.

The O'Connell Street Precinct has a total area of approximately 6,737m2.. It is irregular in shape and is bounded by Spring Street and Bent Street to the north, O'Connell Street to the south and south-east. The Precinct formally contains the following lots and street addresses:

- Lot 1 DP814858 or 1-15 O'Connell Street, Sydney
- Lot 2 DP172068, 8 Spring Street, Sydney
- Lot 1 DP74923 and Lot 1 DP176768 or 10-14 Spring Street, Sydney
- Lot 1 DP724946, 16 Spring Street, Sydney
- Lot 2 DP74923, 17 O'Connell Street, Sydney
- Lot 1 DP131917 or 19-21 O'Connell Street, Sydney
- Strata DP63932, 23 O'Connell Street, Sydney

Collectively, these lots and addresses are referred to as the 'Precinct' or 'Site' throughout this Report. The boundaries of the O'Connell Street Precinct are illustrated in **Figure 1**.



1 Aerial photograph with site outlined in red, not to scale. Source: Ethos Urban



1.5 Overview of the proposal

The O'Connell Street Precinct represents a significant opportunity in Central Sydney to renew several aging assets and deliver a highly engaging and multi-dimensional destination. The holistic reimaging of the Precinct will unlock a key site in the commercial heart of Sydney's Central Business District (CBD), bringing a sense of activity, wonder and respite to an established, but evolving locality.

The reimaging of the O'Connell Street Precinct will comprise an integrated mixed-use commercial development that retains the existing 1 O'Connell Street commercial building, protects existing heritage, introduces a highly permeable and activated ground plane with enhanced public realm edges, provides opportunities for diverse cultural uses, and delivers premium grade commercial floor space in a new office tower.

The realisation of the O'Connell Street Precinct will be achieved through amendments to the Sydney LEP 2012 and Sydney DCP 2012.

The Precinct includes several existing buildings, the majority of which are anticipated to be demolished to facilitate the renewal for the new commercial redevelopment. The heritage listed building at 19-21 O'Connell Street will be retained, as well as the existing 1-15 O'Connell Street commercial building, including the heritage listed facades of the former Chatsworth House and the former Orient Line building.

Properties to be integrated into the whole of site redevelopment – "The O'Connell Street Precinct" are illustrated below:



The Wintergarden, 1-15 O'Connell Street



Orient Line building façade, 2-6 Spring Street.



8 Spring Street



Chatsworth House façade, 1-7 Bent Street.



10-14 Spring Street



23 O'Connell Street



19-21 O'Connell Street



17 O'Connell Street

1.6 Documentation

Documents referred to in this report include:

- 19-21 O'Connell Street Sydney Conservation Management Plan prepared by Megan Jones Architect dated October 2022
- The O'Connell Street Precinct Planning Proposal Urban Design Report prepared by Stewart Architecture and Matthew Pullinger Architect dated February 2024
- The O'Connell Street Precinct Reference Design prepared by Stewart Architecture and Matthew Pullinger Architect dated February 2024
- The O'Connell Street Precinct Planning Justification Report prepared by Ethos Urban dated February 2024
- Desktop Aboriginal Objects Due Diligence Assessment The O'Connell Precinct prepared by
 Niche Environment and Heritage August 2022
- Historical Archaeological Advice & Planning Pathway The O'Connell Precinct prepared by Casey & Lowe Pty Ltd August 2022

1.7 Heritage management context

The O'Connell Street Precinct site contains three heritage items listed on Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012: 19 O'Connell Street and the historic facades of the former Chatsworth House and the former Orient Line building in The Wintergarden site at 1-15 O'Connell Street. 19 O'Connell Street is also listed on the NSW State Heritage Register. The schedule below lists the heritage items within and adjacent to the site.



Surrounding precinct and environs of The O'Connell Precinct (shown outlined in red). Source: Sydney LEP 2012 Heritage map, with overlay.

Local and State listed items within and in the vicinity of the development site are listed below:

Item	NSW SHR	Sydney LEP 2012
19-21 O'Connell Street	01019	l1904
Chatsworth House façade, 1-7 Bent Street	_	I1900
Orient Line Building façade, 2-6 Spring Street	_	I1901
Former Manufacturers House, 12-14 O'Connell Street	-	l1902
Former Bank of NSW, 16 O'Connell Street	-	I1903
Former Sydney Morning Herald Building (Raddison Blu) 64-66 Pitt Street	00586	l1915
Former Department of Lands Building, 22-33 Bridge Street	00744	I1683
Former Department of Education Building, 35-39 Bridge Street	00726	I1684
Palm Trees in Farrer Place	_	l1759
Australia Square including Tower, Plaza Building and Forecourt	_	l1764
Former Liverpool & London & Globe building	_	12288

Note: The former Department of Lands Building and the former Department of Education Building are also included in the National Heritage List: Governors' Domain and Civic Precinct, Macquarie St.

The following table provides a summary of the heritage items within and adjacent to the development site. The only heritage listed building physically affected by the Proposal is 19-21 O'Connell Street. The corner element of the Wintergarden site at 1 O'Connell Street is a representative but not exceptional

example of a 1990s post-modern commercial building and does not meet threshold for local heritage listing.

	l .	
The Public Trustees building (Rofe Chambers) 19-21 O'Connell Street Completed: 1925 Architect: HE Ross & Rowe	The building is associated with the development of the Public Trustee in NSW. It is of social significance because of its association with the management of estates of deceased persons. It is the first office building purchased specifically to accommodate the Public Trustee and is still being used as Head Office of the organisation. The building façade contributes to the streetscape character established by the former bank of New South Wales building on the corner of Hunter and Pitt Streets. It is a good example of the Inter-War Free Classical style of architecture designed by the well-known architects Ross & Rowe.	
The former 'Chatsworth House' façade and the former Orient Line building façade within the Wintergarden site 1-15 O'Connell Street	The Wintergarden is a 36 storey office tower building with a low-scale podium which houses retail. The building has a wedge-shaped footprint which reflects its prominent corner site, with principal entrances on Bent and O'Connell Street. The building is constructed in the late twentieth Century post-modern style and incorporates the historic facades of Chatsworth House (1-7 Bent Street) and the Orient Line building (2-6 Spring Street). The eight-storey sandstone façade of Chatsworth House is designed in a stripped classical style, featuring a combination of rusticated and ashlar sandstone, classically derived mouldings, string courses and quoining and multi-paned steel-framed windows. The seven-storey façade of the Orient Line building (later Macknade House) is a seven storey inter-war building constructed with a steel and concrete framed façade which retains the character of simple regular window openings with Juliette balconies. The façade uses subtle material colours from the Portland stone, sandstone, travertine and granite, and a classical elegance which is reminiscent of Scandinavian and Italian architectural examples from that era. Internal spaces and structures of both Chatsworth House and the Orient Line building were demolished in the late 1980s as part of The Wintergarden development.	
Former Sydney Morning Herald building aka Wales House 66 Pitt Street (cnr O'Connell Street) Completed: 1927 Architect: Manson & Pickering	The building is a large and powerful reminder of the success and prosperity of the publisher-owners, John Fairfax & Sons, and of the dominant role of newspapers in society at that time, before the advent of the electronic media. The building, with its rounded corner treatment on the prominent narrow-vee site provides a good and clearly visible element in the townscape. An aesthetically significant and fine example of the Inter War Commercial Palazzo style, then popular for office buildings of this type, with many intact external elements and some preserved interiors. While having neither the height nor the turn-of-the-century dateline of New York's sharp prowed Flatiron Building, it is still one of the best 'corner buildings' in Sydney. It reflects an image consistent with the perceived role of the Sydney Morning Herald - conservative, substantial, influential and responsible.	

	1	[]
Former Bank of NSW aka Delfin House 16 O'Connell Street Completed: 1940 Architect: C Bruce Dellit	The former Bank of NSW building is one of Australia's finest examples of the Art Deco office building. It originally housed a banking chamber with offices above. The façade comprises two zones. The first consists of a decorative archway clad in granite rising four floors in height which dominates the streetscape. Above rises an expanse of sandstone. The building features stylized and geometric semi-abstract decoration. On bronze doors and carved panels beneath the arch the architect has allegorized the spirit of the machine age in New South Wales "The Age of Plenty". The façades style and detail are of exceptional significance representing a departure from traditional forms and expressing contemporary modern design concepts and building technologies by integrating materials with function and structure. The building's contribution of the O'Connell Street streetscape is considerable.	
Former Manufacturers House (Manufacturers Mutual Insurance Company building) 12-14 O'Connell Street Completed: 1935 Architect: SH Buchanan & Cowper	Manufacturers House is a nine storey building built for the NSW Chamber of Manufacturers in the early 1930s, in a modest Inter War Art Deco Style. The building comprises predominantly Australian materials and is significant for its reflection of the cautious emergence of business confidence following the period of economic depression and industrial unrest of the late 1920s. The building is a rare and outstanding example of a highly intact original commercial face brick exterior of high quality design with outstanding potential to continue in its restored state. The building is well resolved in its detailing in both its interior and exterior and is particularly noted for its use of face brick and chevron motifs, and its relationship of materials to the adjacent Delfin House. The building is significant for its contribution to the development of the Hunter and O'Connell Street Art Deco precinct.	
Former Department of Education Building 35-39 Bridge Street Completed: 1912 and 1928 Architect: George McRae and John Reid	The Department of Education Building demonstrates Edwardian architectural style and planning concepts; its historic features reveal Edwardian taste and customs - for example, the grand sequence from entry porch to Ministerial Board Room. The building, especially where it remains in original condition, a particularly fine example of an early 20th century government office building, featuring an innovative internal steel frame that allowed for future re-use. It is an important example of the architecture of the period 1915-1930. The external design is highly disciplined and uses a limited palette of materials: Sydney sandstone, metal framed windows, copper- clad skylights. It makes a major contribution to this part of Sydney, visually linking with other imposing sandstone government buildings and enhancing a number of important city vistas. It has townscape value.	

		1
Former Department of Lands Building 22-33 Bridge Street Completed: 1876- 1890 Architects: James Barnet, William Kemp and Walter Liberty Vernon	The building is one of the most outstanding surviving Victorian buildings in Sydney and is one of the most influential and major public building ever established during the mid-nineteenth century in Australia. The building has been used continuously for the purpose which it was designed for - as the administrative head office of Department of Lands. It has a long association with the public life of NSW, especially the rapid expansion of settlement during the latter part of the 19th century. The building forms a visually satisfying enclosure to the southern side of Macquarie Place and relates in scale and materials to the other Government buildings at the eastern end of Bridge Street. A vital landmark in the history of surveying, land titles and public works in New South Wales.	
Palm Trees in Farrer Place	Farrer Place commemorates William Farrer (1845- 1906), pioneer in the development of drought and disease resistant wheat strains. These hardy and drought tolerant palms from northern Mexico were used extensively throughout the latter part of the nineteenth century and early twentieth century, particularly during the Inter-War period (c.1915- 1940). The group of three Washington Palms (Washingtonia robusta), located in raised planter beds, are old specimens relating to the Department of Education building. The park forms an important part of the City's public open space. The palms are significant in terms of their visual, aesthetic and historic values.	
Australia Square including Tower, Plaza Building and Forecourt 264-278 George Street (and 87-95 Pitt Street) Completed:1967 Architect: Harry Seidler	Australia Square is one of the most outstanding late twentieth century international style works of architecture for which Harry Seidler was awarded both the Royal Australian Institute of Architects Sulman Medal and Civic Design Award in 1967, in the year of its completion. Australia Square Tower established new principles in design and construction through its distinctive efficient cylindrical form, the use of reinforced concrete shaped sculpturally for structural efficiency and its innovative approach to urban renewal, through site amalgamation, and being the first to translate the incentives of the interim City of Sydney Strategic Plan into creation of an extensive plaza that remains one of the most highly successful civic spaces in Australia. It is of historic significance for its pioneering approach to the problems of urban redevelopment through amalgamation and the provision of public space on private land, thus minimising problems of pedestrian congestion. It was the first city block development in Sydney and a milestone for its architectural and urban contribution to the post war city. It is aesthetically significant as a finely crafted building and a seminal work by Seidler.	

Former Liverpool & London & Globe building 62 Pitt Street Completed: 1962 Architect: Spain Cosh & Stewart	The former Liverpool & London & Globe building provides uncommon evidence of the prevalence of insurance companies in Central Sydney during the post-World War II period, which were concentrated in the northern section of Central Sydney known as the "golden mile". It represents Sydney's post-World War II boom of international finance and insurance. The site and building are associated with the prominent and long established company, Liverpool & London & Globe Insurance, which occupied the site from 1874 for over 100 years and for whom this building was purpose-built.	
	The building demonstrates an individual and distinctive example of the Late Twentieth Century International style by the prominent architectural firm, Spain Cosh & Stewart. The design of the building, both in plan, with its rare triangular form, and external expression, skilfully responds to the acute-angled and visually prominent corner site. Its facades are a distinctive example of curtain wall design in terms of its construction, unusual colour scheme, and the rare and late use of pigmented structural glass as spandrel panels.	
	The Dobell Memorial sculpture commemorates one of Australia's most celebrated landscape and portrait artists. The sculpture, created by Bert Flugelman, is a 19.5m high stack of highly polished stainless steel shaped pyramids balancing atop each other. The highly reflective surfaces are intended to capture both the people and the surrounds.	

2 19-21 O'CONNELL STREET CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN 2022

2.1 Historical overview

The following summary of the history of the development of 19-21 O'Connell Street is extracted from the 19-21 O'Connell Street Sydney Conservation Management Plan 2022. Refer to the Conservation Management Plan for the detailed history.

- c1872 Prominent merchant company director and philanthropist John Frazer of Ranelagh esquire purchased the allotment bounded by 14 Spring Street and 19-21 O'Connell Street.
- 1873 Two adjoining warehouses were completed for John Frazer & Co to the design of architects Mansfield Bros. in the middle of the year
- 1875 A five storey building at 14 Spring Street was completed for John Frazer to the design of Mansfield Bros. It was owned by Frazer. It was occupied by the stores and warehouse of merchants Mason Bros.
- 1878 The title to both properties was conveyed to directors of John Frazer & Co. in the middle of the year.
- 1924 The title to both properties was transferred to solicitor and company director John Fulton Rofe, principal of the legal firm Alfred Rofe & Sons.



- 3 These images from the City Council Demolition Books shows the building that was demolished in 1924 to make way for Rofe Chambers. L: View from the south-east. R: View from the south west Source: City of Sydney Archives: 19 O'Connell Street (30/10/1924), [A-00037272] https://archives.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/nodes/view/66363 and 663638
- 1925 Rofe sold 14 Spring Street to the Yorkshire Insurance Company in the middle of the year.
- 1926 The building presently occupying 19-21 O'Connell Street was completed to the design of architects H E Ross & Rowe. It was named Rofe Chambers. Typically for this period, Alfred Rofe & Sons occupied part of the second floor and the rest of the building was tenanted.



4 Rofe Chambers under construction Source: The Australasian, 24 October 1925

5 Rofe Chambers circa 1926 Source: State Library of NSW, digital order no. Hall_38429

Description of the building when completed:

This is an exceedingly neat design for a comparatively small city building. Owing to the accentuation of the few horizontal lines in the composition, not only are the perpendicular lines well-balanced, but the building is afforded the appearance of extra frontage and although it is at least seven storeys in height, or eight if the mezzanine is included, it is treated almost as a two-storey building and so exact is the scale that quiet elegance of style is assured. For a short period, it was the fashion to repeat the lower decorative portion of the building in the final floors treating the middle portion with plane surfaces but in this design, we see a more ambitious effort at real design which is at once varied and successfully ornamental. The first floor exterior certainly resembles in style the top floor, but it is in becomingly varied and the panelled pilasters, which unite the intervening floors, are carefully chosen for the purpose and in are in perfect harmony with a substantial but altogether happy and well-proportioned front which, with its expression of affluence and dignity is likely to impress visitors and observers with confidence in the presiding firm.¹

¹ Building, Vol. 41 No. 241, 12 September 1927, p. 140





6 Front of Rofe Chambers, 5 May 1927. The name plates and window signage show the various businesses operating from the premises. Cahills Luncheon Room can been seen on the basement windows, W.R. Carpenter & Co on the mezzanine windows.

Source: SLNSW: Arthur Earnest Foster, Series 03 Part 05: Sydney Shops, Offices and Stores Etc...Ca. 1924-1927, Box 22 No. 237. Rofe Chambers, O'Connell Street, 1927, item FL349573 Bronze encased entrance doors to Rofe Chambers, Sydney Source: *40 years of Wunderlich*





Ground Floor Plan and Typical upper floor plan 1924 Source: City of Sydney Archives

Megan Jones Architect

8



9

NSW Fire Underwriters Association Detail Survey Map Block No. 115 and Block No. 118, c1939 Source: City of Sydney – Historical Atlas of Sydney.

 \bigcirc

1933 19-21 O'Connell Street passed to Alfred and Edgar Rofe after John Fulton Rofe died.

In March 1935 the trade journal *Building* magazine included a description of O'Connell Street as part of an article on the recently completed Manufacturers Mutual building opposite Rofe Chambers:

Architecturally, O'Connell Street has become during the past 10 years one of Sydney's most interesting thoroughfares. The quality of the architecture in practically every building as a distinct unit is of a particularly high order. Withal, however there is no clashing of styles and the majority of the structures apparently have been designed with some thought for their neighbours, and, above all, the variety of the facing materials used lends interest to the vista that one obtains looking along the street. The intermingling of brick, stone, terra-cotta and even cement rendering provides a contrast that gives the street much of its charm. The Permanent Trustees building, McKinney House, Pitt, Son & Badgery's Building, Manufacturer's Mutual Building provide a pleasant sight when contrasted with his stone neighbours in the Sydney Morning Herald building, Rofe Chambers Brook House, the South British Insurance Building, and others. They make O'Connell Street from an architectural point of view one of the show places of Sydney, providing an answer to those to advocate a building covenant for Martin Place, allowing natural stone only as a facing material.²

² Building March 1935 p21



10 O'Connell Street in August 1938, view from Bent Street intersection. Source: SLNSW: Sam Hood, Home and Away – 9384, image FL1318558



- 11 10-25 O'Connell Street; McKinsey House, Orient Steamship, 1939 Source: SLNSW: Hall & Co, Home and Away – 35225, image FL1643461
- 1941 19-21 O'Connell Street was sold to the Minister for Public Works. The transfer of title took place on 24 November.
- 1942 19-21 O'Connell Street was modified and officially opened by Premier William McKell on 2 March. It became known as the Public Trust Building.
- 1945 The title to 19-21 O'Connell Street was transferred to the Public Trustee.
- 1950s Minor refurbishments throughout building

The following images record the external and internal presentation of the building in the 1960s.



O'Connell Street entrance to The Public Trustee building, 1961. Source: SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 –

10615, image FL2138739



Reception rooms at Public Service Board 19 O'Connell St, 10 July 1967. Source: SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 -19955, image FL2196012



Reception rooms at Public Service Board 19 O'Connell St, 10 July 1967. [SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 - 19953, image FL2197447]



O'Connell Street entrance to The Public Trustee building, 1961. Source: SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 -10613, image FL2122734



Reception rooms at Public Service Board 19 O'Connell St, 10 July 1967. Source: SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 -19956, Image FL2217058



Reception rooms at Public Service Board 19 O'Connell St, 10 July 1967. [SLNSW: Government Printing Office 2 - 19954, image FL2181596]

1967 Minor changes to Ground Floor

1970 NSW Public Service Board employment and recruitment section moved out of the building to the Goodsell Building in Chifley Square.1971 An administrative restructuring of the Public

Trustees Office was completed. The Public Trustee was to be the sole occupant of the building. The building was substantially remodelled including:

- Removal of all interior fit-out and furniture
- Centrally located lifts removed and new lifts located on south side
- Internal marble stair removed, and new fire stairs introduced on south side
- Light wells infilled with concrete floor slabs
- Front entrance relocated to south side and central bay closed in
- Basement converted to a car park accessed from the northern opening on O'Connell Street
- All front façade windows replaced with aluminium framed glazing and bronze anodised aluminium cladding was added to the facade
- Caretaker's residence on the 7th floor removed and a new caretaker's room incorporated into the basement
- Air conditioning plant room installed on the roof

As a result of these extensive renovations, only the external envelope, sandstone façade, concrete floors and columns remained. The following building approval plans show the extent of the intervention.



12 Ground Floor Plan from 1970 Building approval drawings for major alterations to 19 O'Connell Street Source: City of Sydney Archives



13 Street Elevation and Section from 1970 Building approval drawings for major alterations to 19 O'Connell Street
Source: City of Sudaey Archives



14 Sections from 1970 Building approval drawings for major alterations to 19 O'Connell Street Source: City of Sydney Archives Photographer Max Dupain recorded the completed works:



19 O'Connell Street, September 1971 Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Job no. 9141: Public Trust Building, 19 O'Connell Street, Sydney, September 1971, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, Contact sheet image 36537_11



19 O'Connell Street, September 1971 Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_07



September 1971. The stair and lift housing on rooftop has been altered. Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_10



September 1971. The arch at right has been altered to provide driveway access to the new basement carparking.

Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_09



Entrance had been moved to the southern archway. September 1971

Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_13



New entrance at 19 O'Connell Street, September 1971

Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_12



Travertine clad lift foyer. 19 O'Connell Street, September 1971 Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_03



September 1971. Interior partitions at 19 O'Connell Street.

SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_04



19 O'Connell Street, September 1971 Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_14



19 O'Connell Street, September 1971 Source: SLNSW: Max Dupain, Call no. ON 558/Box 82/nos. 580-594, contact sheet image 36537_01

- 1978 Further alterations to Basement, Ground Floor and Level 6
- 1989 Refurbishment and asbestos removal as part of the installation of a new computer network system. Floors carpeted and walls painted. New Partitions and furnishings introduced and some elements from the 1971 renovation were removed.
- 1997 The building was described in a report by Clive Lucas, Stapleton & Partners as:

'... essentially a 1924 façade and concrete structure with 1971 alterations and a 1971 interior with extensive 1989 alterations.'³

- 2003 Fire safety upgrade and internal office fit out
- 2021 Internal office fit-outs
- 2022 19 O'Connell Street Sydney was sold by the NSW State Government to Lendlease's Australian Prime Property Fund Commercial (Lendlease) in mid-April 2022 for \$93.5 million. As part of the sale agreement, the Public Trustee, now-NSW Trustee & Guardian, will continue to occupy the building until June 2025 as part of the sale agreement.⁴
- 2.2 Heritage significance

The following statement of heritage significance is extracted from the 19-21 O'Connell Street Sydney Conservation Management Plan 2022.

19-21 O'Connell Street was designed by eminent architectural firm HE Ross & Rowe and built in 1925 as Rofe Chambers for the legal firm Alfred Rofe & Sons. In 1941 Rofe Chambers was acquired by the State Government. The Public Trust Building was officially opened by the premier, William McKell on 2 March 1942. In 1971 major alterations and additions were carried out to suit the NSW Public Trustee.

Although it has undergone substantial internal alterations and external modifications, 19 O'Connell Street is a good representative example of an Inter War Commercial Palazzo style office building that makes a significant contribution to the streetscape of O'Connell Street. It has associations with solicitors Alfred Rofe & Sons, who commissioned the building for their own use and for investment purposes, with the prominent firm of H E Ross & Rowe, who were responsible for large and important commercial and office buildings during the 1910s and 1920s. It is also associated with the Public Trustee, a State instrumentality that assumed the role of the Curator of Intestate Estate and has which occupied the building since 1941.

The present interiors comprise typical commercial office fit-outs which do not demonstrate any associations with NSW Public Trustees other than the Public Trustee logo in the entry lobby floor. Remaining significant original interior fabric includes the concrete structure – columns, beams and slabs. Although the interior fit-out has been modified, an understanding of the original structural grid and internal spatial qualities remains evident.

Early fabric of historical interest includes Chubb strong rooms at levels 4 and 5. These are typical of the inter-war period but do not demonstrate any direct associations with either the original use of the building or its later occupation by NSW Public Trustees.

2.3 Principles and Policies

The 2022 CMP provides the following principles and policies regarding the integration of 19-21 O'Connell Street into The O'Connell Precinct development:

³ Clive Lucas Stapleton and Partners, Public Trustees Office, p.43

⁴ NSW Department of Planning and Environment: 'New life for heritage-listed Sydney CBD property', 14 April 2022, web, 15 August 2022, https://www.dpie.nsw.gov.au/news-and-events/articles/2022/new-life-forheritage-listed-sydney-cbd-property

Principles

Any proposal to integrate 19-21 O'Connell Street with a commercial tower development on the adjoining properties should maintain the identified heritage values of the building and should demonstrate benefits for the ongoing use and maintenance of the building. The primary consideration is to ensure the functional utility and sustainable future of the building (either as an independent building or integrated with the adjacent development). 19-21 O'Connell Street must not be orphaned but should be conserved, enhanced, and celebrated as an integral component of the site redevelopment. The building is capable of adaption for continued commercial or other uses, the principal physical constraints comprising the retention of the building's façade, perimeter walls and internal structure.

Policies and Guidelines

Policy 18 19 O'Connell Street will be conserved, enhanced, and celebrated as an integral component of the site redevelopment.

Generally

- The building's physical integrity and aesthetic contribution to the streetscape should be maintained and enhanced.
- The perimeter walls, front facade and structural grid should be conserved with missing elements of the front facade reconstructed.
- The relationship of new construction to 19 O'Connell Street should allow the building to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and the public domain and have an active role within the site.
- Modifications to the building fabric to allow for its integration into the site-wide development should be carefully designed and sympathetically located, to ensure a sense of the original/early floor plate and structural grid is retained.

Exterior

- Ensure the building can be appreciated in 3D (not as wallpaper) by conserving and revealing the solid corners and at least one whole structural bay on each side of the front facade
- Reconstruct missing facade elements to their original design including the original metal spandrel panels, decorative cornice details and windows
- The building should retain its own front entrance from O'Connell Street either in its existing location or its original location
- Openings through the side and rear walls are acceptable considering the structural grid and retaining the solidity of corners.
- The rear of the building has been modified over time and presents an opportunity for further modification to provide for connections and visual interaction with the rest of the development.
- Retain original fabric including sandstone façade and masonry and concrete side and rear walls.
 Avoid major alterations to the front façade other than reconstructing missing elements.
- The 1970s roof top plant room can be removed.
- Consider activation of the roof top for public use as it provides a unique opportunity to view the roofscapes of O'Connell Street.

Interior

- Carefully consider the alignment of the floor levels of the building into the adjacent development.
 The upper floor levels (above Ground Floor) of 19 O'Connell Street should not be altered to suit the floor levels of the new development.
- Modifications to the rear of the building to enhance the connection of the building into the whole site and to provide a fully accessible/glazed façade should be carefully designed to interpret the structural grid and footprint of the original building.
- Modifications to the Basement (which has already been substantially modified) to integrate it into the whole of site Basement should be designed to minimise impact on the upper floors.
- Consider the ability to fire isolate the building from the rest of the development, eg provide independent vertical circulation and building services.

Upper storey additions to 19 O'Connell Street

- New rooftop additions may be permissible. Roof top additions should not extend closer to O'Connell Street than the existing plant room.
- Rooftop additions should not involve alterations to the front parapet and the structure should not encroach into the footprint of 19 O'Connell Street other than at the rear
- The design for the rooftop addition should be of contemporary architectural design and materials.

Podium development

The architectural resolution of the new podiums on Spring Street and O'Connell Street may interpret the original lots and the fine grain of the streetscape and maintain the streetscape presence. Options include:

- 19 O'Connell Street is part of a contiguous podium with a considered datum
- 19 O'Connell Street is integrated with either the northern or the southern buildings with a laneway flanking one side wall
- 19 O'Connell Street is an isolated building with laneways flanking it

The quality of the architecture and material of the new podium buildings should be equal to or better than that of 19 O'Connell Street. Connections between the new podium buildings and 19 O'Connell Street should respect its independent identity and enhance its functionality.

Tower development

The following considerations apply to the relationship of the new tower and its core to 19 O'Connell Street:

- The tower should have sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow 19 O'Connell Street to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane.
- The location of the new core in relation to 19 O'Connell Street should ensure that an efficient core and an enhanced ground plane is achieved **and**:
 - The tower and core structure may encroach into the footprint of 19 O'Connell Street at the rear of the building
 - The location of the core facilitates the activation of 19 O'Connell Street in the ground plane and at the upper levels

- The vertical transportation for the tower is independent of 19 O'Connell Street
- The location of the core facilitates street level activation of both Spring and O'Connell Streets
- Modifications to the rear of the building to facilitate the construction of the tower and core, to enhance the connection of the building into the whole site and to provide a fully accessible/glazed façade should be carefully designed to interpret the structural grid and footprint of the original building.

The following diagram illustrates some of these guidelines for integration of 19 O'Connell Street with the wider site development.



- Through site link to the south of 19 O'Connell Street
- Office tower entry lobby to the north of 19 O'Connell Street
 Central entry to 19 O'Connell Street reinstated
- All four facades of 19 O'Connell Street exposed at Ground and First Floor (entry level) and the front and rear are exposed on all levels
- Rear of 19 O'Connell Street reconstructed to interpret the structural grid and footprint of the original building, to integrate it with the tower centre core and to provide a fully accessible/glazed façade
- Lift and stairs to serve 19 O'Connell Street to south of building
- No tower or podium structure within 19 O'Connell Street footprint other than the rear

15

Policy 19 New uses for 19 O'Connell Street will be selected on the basis that they will enhance the appreciation of the history and heritage significance of the place and ensure conservation of the building and its significant fabric and components.

Guidelines

The long-term management of the site, including its adaptation to new uses, should consider its heritage significance. All decisions should consider and seek to retain the heritage values of the place.

New uses for the building may be compatible provided that the following criteria are met:

- the cultural significance of the building and its extant internal spaces and detailing are not compromised;
- the proposed new use does not detract from original uses and does not diminish the cultural significance or setting of the building;
- the detailed requirements of the new uses do not generate undue changes to the existing significant spaces and fabric that cannot be reversed in the long term, or which do not respect and work within the existing architectural framework; and
- works associated with new uses are clearly identifiable and detailed in a contemporary manner rather than replicating the original detailing of the affected building.

Future uses for the site should also be consistent with the following:

- new uses should be selected on the basis that they "fit" existing spaces
- substantial alterations and/or removal of significant fabric to suit the requirements of a new use should be avoided
- future adaptation of the interiors should ensure that original spaces, elements and fabric are retained and conserved
- future subdivision of internal spaces, where appropriate, should be undertaken in a "subservient" manner, using partitions that can be easily removed and would not impact on existing significant wall, ceiling and floor finishes
- external alterations to meet new uses must avoid adverse visual and physical impact. Minor changes to meet access and other functional requirements are likely to be permissible provided that these are subservient to the primary architectural features of the building.

The new use for 19 O'Connell Street must be respectful of its significance and not require major interventions that remove, modify, or obstruct its internal structural grid or its independent identity. New uses should maintain the cultural significance of the place and allow for sympathetic changes to the fabric. Feasible and compatible uses for 19 O'Connell Street include commercial office, retail, educational, public or community facilities eg art gallery, library.

Policy 20 Alterations and additions for the adaptive re-use of 19 O'Connell Street will be designed to minimise adverse impacts on the heritage significance of the building as a whole and its significant components.

Guidelines

 The new use for 19 O'Connell Street must be respectful of its significance and not require major interventions that remove, modify, or obstruct its internal structural grid or its independent identity. New uses should maintain the cultural significance of the place and allow for sympathetic changes to the fabric.

- Modifications to the building fabric and in less significant spaces to allow for its integration into the site-wide development should be carefully designed and sympathetically located, to ensure a sense of the original/early floor plate and structural grid is retained.
- The building should retain its own front entrance from O'Connell Street either in its existing location or its original location
- Consider reconstruction of missing elements including the original metal spandrel panels, decorative cornice details and windows.
- Retain original fabric including sandstone façade and masonry and concrete side and rear walls.
 Avoid major alterations to the front façade other than reconstructing missing elements.
- The 1970s roof top plant room can be removed.
- Consider activation of the roof top for public use as it provides a unique opportunity to view the roofscapes of O'Connell Street.
- Retain the existing structural column grid to ensure interpretation of the building's original spatial organisation.
- Modifications to the Ground Floor level to provide on grade access must be carefully designed to ensure the architectural qualities of the building are not impacted.
- Introduce new lightwells and atria or re-instate original lightwells to improve natural light access and to improve vertical connections through the building.
- Consider the role of the original lightwells in bringing natural light into the sides and rear of the building and ensure that the new development enhances the building's access to natural light.
- Any upgrade of the building structure for BCA compliance including seismic strengthening should be creatively designed and be integrated with the works for adaptive re-use.
- The interior finishes and fit-out has been heavily altered, with much of the original fabric removed.
 New fit-outs should retain all extant historic fabric where possible.
- Ensure that any new false ceilings do not extend below the heads of windows.
- Ensure that new partitions do not obstruct windows.
- The early Chubb safes may be retained, adapted or removed as required to suit new uses.

The following diagram illustrates some of these guidelines for the adaptation of 19 O'Connell Street



16 19 O'Connell Street adaptation opportunities and constraints diagram showing:

- 1. The perimeter walls, front facade and structural grid conserved
- 2. The building can be appreciated in 3D (not as wallpaper) by retaining "solid" corners
- 3. Missing facade elements reconstructed to their original design
- 4. Main entry from O'Connell Street retained with provision for on grade access
- 5. New lightwells introduced or original lightwells re-instated to improve natural light access
- 6. Atria introduced to improve vertical connections through the building
- 7. Openings through the side and rear walls introduced considering the structural grid and retaining the solidity of corners. Opportunities for access to natural light introduced
- 8. Modifications to the rear of the building for the connection of the building into the whole site and to provide a fully accessible/glazed façade. Structural grid and footprint of the original building reconstructed and interpreted.

2.4 Settings and views

The redevelopment of the O'Connell Street Precinct including a commercial office tower has the potential to impact the heritage values of 19 O'Connell Street and neighbouring heritage items. As outlined at section 2.2, the 19 O'Connell Street building demonstrates heritage significance largely from its sandstone façade and the contribution it makes to the O'Connell Street streetscape.

To assess the potential impact of a commercial development on the setting and views of the building, key views to the building and the development site are identified and are illustrated. The views are from pedestrian vantage points.

O'Connell Street is a narrow street meaning that the full height of the existing buildings is not evident at street level, but the first few levels can be appreciated in detail. 19 O'Connell Street is not prominent in views from each end of O'Connell Street. However, the building is an integral component of the group with the interwar buildings opposite, ie the former Manufacturers House (12-14) and the former Bank of NSW building (16).

Throughout the 20th century, both sides of O'Connell Street were occupied by commercial buildings occupying the full extent of their sites with varying heights, creating a consistent streetscape with diversity of grain and architectural design.



View 1 Looking south down O'Connell Street from Farrer Place



View 2 Looking South down O'Connell Street from adjacent to 1 Bligh Street



View 3 Looking west towards 19 O'Connell Street from adjacent to 12-14 O'Connell Street





View 4 Looking North towards 19 O'Connell Street from corner of Hunter and O'Connell Streets



View 5 Looking North towards former SMH building from the corner of Hunter and Pitt Street



View 6 Looking East towards 10 Spring Street from corner of Pitt and Bond Streets





View 7 Looking South down Spring Street from corner of Spring and Bent Streets



View 8 Looking South towards the retained facades of Chatsworth House and Orient Line from Gresham Street



View 9 Looking South towards the Wintergarden from Farrer Place



View 10 Looking West from 1 Bligh Street towards the Wintergarden and the Lands Department Building

3 HISTORY AND SIGNIFICANCE OF 1-15 O'CONNELL STREET

3.1 Overview history

In 1990 the Wintergarden development of 1-15 O'Connell Street amalgamated six lots in the late 1980s.



17 Extract from 1949-1972 Surveyors Sheet showing the Wintergarden site aerial prior to redevelopment. Source: City of Sydney Archives

1 O'Connell Street

Historic records show that three commercial office buildings have occupied the site at the intersection of O'Connell and Bent Streets since the early 20th century. The CSR headquarters building c1905, the Knox Building c1966 and the existing lower portion of The Wintergarden. These three buildings were built to the site boundaries and defined the corner.





- 18 1943 aerial photograph showing the CSR headquarters building at the intersection of Bent and O'Connell Streets. Source: SIX Maps Sydney
- 19 CSR Headquarters Building c1960 at 1 O'Connell Street Sydney (prior to demolition) Source: http://hdl.handle.net/1885/49203





20 Demolition of the CSR Headquarters to make way for Knox House at 1 O'Connell Street Sydney Source: City of Sydney Archives

21 Knox House under construction at 1 O'Connell Street Sydney c1966 Source: City of Sydney Archives



22 1 O'Connell Street Sydney 2022

Chatsworth House (1-7 Bent Street)

There were at least two buildings on this site between the mid and late 1880's. The buildings housed shipping agents, merchants, financiers and pastoral agents. Prominent amongst these companies were companies involved in Australia's important wool market and, from the 1880's until the 1920's, the shipping agents Gilchrist, Watt & Co. The CSR initially tenanted the site from the 1920's, establishing its corporate library there in 1927. It is likely that the company demolished that building and constructed a new building on that site, adjacent to its head office in O'Connell Street, in 1937. The library was relocated to the second and third floors of this building. The company retained its use of the building until November 1987. The library was finally relocated to Pyrmont.

The Orient Line building (2-6 Spring Street)

In May 1940 the magazine Decoration & Glass reported on the newly-completed Orient Line building in Spring Street Sydney, seeing it as an example of the smaller type of office building erected for almost entire use by the owners. The Orient Steam Navigation Company occupied more than half of the building and were expected to increase the space required for their own use on resumption of normal business following the war. The magazine explained that the design of the building had been kept extremely simple

in character, "at times bordering on severity, following the lines of recent European architecture" and that it had been the aim of the architects to give the building "something of the clean functional quality of the

Orient liners 'Orion' and 'Orcades'. The chief decorative feature of the exterior of the building was a pair of giant metal anchor grilles attached to the mezzanine windows and finished in aluminium, blue and gold leaf. Art in Australia reported in the same month that the building made a valuable contribution to the architecture of the city through its simple design, relying on interest in materials and a controlled use of colour. Art and Architecture thought that a very praiseworthy feature of the building was the way in which talented designers had been commissioned to carry out, under the direction of the architects, special decorative features. Staff facilities included a luncheon room, a kitchenette, and a sun balcony and rooftop games deck, where deck tennis, quoits, darts, and other shipboard games could be played by employees of the Orient Company. The building was the recipient of the Sulman Award in 1943 and received an RIBA bronze medal in 1947.



 Chatsworth House before and during the Wintergarden development Sources: nla.obj-296424659-42 & City of Sydney UI A-00023692

24 The Orient Building before Wintergarden development Source: PH-08294-00 @ P&O Heritage Collection

The Wintergarden

The development of 1-15 O'Connell Street involved the demolition of all buildings on the site except for the facades of the former Chatsworth House and the Orient Line building. The 38-storey office tower at 1-15 O'Connell Street was designed by Peddle Thorpe & Walker and completed in 1991. The building was designed in the post-modern style and incorporates the facades of Chatsworth House and the Orient Line Building. The carpark entry through the Chatsworth House façade was created as part of the redevelopment.

3.2 Statement of Significance

Although the whole of the Wintergarden site at 1-15 O'Connell Street is listed on Schedule 5 of the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 as an Item of Environmental Heritage, it is only the remnant facades of Chatsworth House and the Orient Building that are identified as heritage items. The following statements of heritage significance are extracted from the NSW Heritage Database:

Chatsworth House façade

The facade of Chatsworth House is significant for the quality of the design and detailing and for its representative value as an excellent example of the inter-war period and classical design. Its relationship to the major group of Government Offices in the city from the Victorian period, all of sandstone

construction is also significant. The facade is significant for its street architecture value terminating the axis of Gresham Street and as part of Bent Street.

Orient Line building facade

The Orient Building is an award winning building reflecting the attitudes to architecture in Australia and Britain in the 1940's. It is a good example of the influence of English design in Australia after the recession and an early example of the work of Fowell and McConnell, prominent Sydney architects of the Post War period. The building, a seven storey steel and concrete framed construction, has a simple and clear facade, to Spring Street, made up of well-defined elements. The flat surface of the facade is punctured by a regular fenestration pattern giving the building a distinct classical feeling. There is a tripartite composition within the modulation of the facade; ground floor section and top floor with balcony. Surfaced with polished granite with aluminium windows, the facade even though classically derived, is truly in the modern mode of expression.

4 DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSAL

4.1 Background

The Central Sydney Planning Strategy (CSPS) was first released in 2016 and sets out a 20-year land use vision, planning priorities and actions to achieve a place-led and people-led vision for growth in Central Sydney. The CSPS were endorsed by Council on 14 December 2020 and amendments to the Sydney LEP 2012 were gazetted in December 2021, supported by amendments to the Sydney DCP 2012.

The central aim of the CSPS is to support good growth while balancing the need to protect and enhance the public places that make the city unique. It provides the strategic direction to continue to position and strengthen Central Sydney as Australia's most productive and strategically important employment centre. Through 10 key moves, the CSPS balances opportunities for development to meet demands and achieve Council's job targets through to 2036, being 100,000 jobs unlocked through an additional 2.9 million square metres of employment generating floor space.

Importantly, the CSPS includes opportunities for increased height and density in key locations, balanced with environmental sustainability initiatives and sets criteria for excellence in urban design. In this context, and over a number of years, the Proponent has brought together the individual sites within the O'Connell Precinct to amalgamate a collective Precinct with the intention to deliver a world class mixed-use commercial redevelopment.

The amendments sought to the Sydney LEP 2012 and Sydney DCP 2012 have been discussed with Council staff over several years, including presentations of the proposal to Council's Design Advisory Panel. These pre-lodgement discussions have informed the proposed amendments and scope of the assessment provided within this Report.

4.2 Overview of the Proposal

The reimaging of the O'Connell Street Precinct will comprise an integrated mixed-use commercial development that retains the existing 1 O'Connell Street commercial building, protects the existing cultural heritage buildings and facades, introduces a highly permeable and activated ground plane with enhanced public realm edges, provides opportunities for diverse cultural uses, and delivers premium grade commercial floor space in a new office tower.

The realisation of the O'Connell Street Precinct will be achieved through amendments to the Sydney LEP 2012 and Sydney DCP 2012. The amendments sought to the Sydney LEP 2012 will encourage and facilitate the reimagining of the Precinct for a non-residential development by allowing for:

- an increased maximum Floor Space Ratio (FSR); and
- an increased maximum Building Height.

Supporting the amendments to the Sydney LEP 2012 is an amendment to the Sydney DCP 2012 which includes site-specific controls that address matters such as building envelope; pedestrian connections; parking; vehicular access and loading; design excellence; heritage; sustainability; and public art.

The proposed amendments will directly support Council's endorsed CSPS by unlocking additional employment generating floor space. They will also facilitate significant public benefits to be delivered on site, through new cultural and community uses, east-west through site link, enhanced activation, and embellishment of the public domain.

4.3 The Reference Design

For assessment purposes, the vision for the O'Connell Street Precinct has been articulated in two reference designs prepared by Stewart Architecture and Matthew Pullinger Architect. These reference designs are provided in the supporting document with the Request for a Planning Proposal and DCP amendment and serves as a baseline proof of concept.

The reference designs are indicative schemes used to demonstrate that the proposed tower envelope can accommodate a high quality architectural outcome. These designs are indicative reference only – the final design for the site will be determined by an architectural design competition. The reference schemes focuses on strategies for access and ground plane connectivity, relationship to context, location of the tower core and the potential yield for the site.

Extract from the Reference Designs are included below for information:



25 Perspective included in the Reference Designs Source: Stewart Architecture and Matthew Pullinger Architect

5 ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

5.1 Introduction

This section of the report identifies and assesses the potential heritage impacts associated with the proposal to amend the Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 and Sydney Development Control Plan 2012. The planning proposal and reference design is assessed against the relevant policies contained the 19-21 O'Connell Street Sydney Conservation Management Plan 2022, the standard questions in the 1996 HeritageNSW publication: *Statements of Heritage Impact* and the relevant policies in the Sydney DCP 2012.

The assessment against the provisions of the Sydney Local Environment Plan 2012 and the Sydney Development Control Plan 2012 are included in the Planning Justification Report prepared by Ethos Urban.

5.2 Assessment of heritage impact on 19-21 O'Connell Street

5.2.1 Assessment of heritage impact in relation to the 2022 CMP policies

The proposal is assessed against the 2022 Conservation Management Plan conservation policies and guidelines:

CMP 2022 Policy	Assessment of the Proposal
Policy 18 19 O'Connell Street will be conserved, enhanced, and celebrated as an integral component of the site redevelopment	 The Reference Designs demonstrate that: The building's physical integrity and aesthetic contribution to the streetscape will be maintained and enhanced. The perimeter walls, front facade and structural grid will be conserved with missing elements of the front facade reconstructed and/or interpreted. The relationship of new construction (podium and tower) to 19 O'Connell Street will allow the building to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and the public domain and have an active role within the site. Modifications to the building fabric to allow for its integration into the site-wide development will ensure that a sense of the original/early floor plate and structural grid is retained.
Policy 19 New uses for 19 O'Connell Street will be selected on the basis that they will enhance the appreciation of the history and heritage significance of the place and ensure conservation of the building and its significant fabric and components Policy 20 Alterations and additions for the adaptive re-use of 19 O'Connell Street will be designed to minimise adverse impacts on the heritage significance of the building as a whole and its significant components	 The Reference Designs demonstrate that new uses can be introduced into the building which: Are respectful of its significance and do not require major interventions that remove, modify, or obstruct its internal structural grid or its independent identity. Maintain the cultural significance of the place and allow for sympathetic changes to the fabric.

5.2.2 Assessment of heritage impact in relation to the HeritageNSW standard questions

The following table sets out the assessment of the Proposal using the relevant standard questions in the 1996 HeritageNSW publication: *Statements of Heritage Impact*.

Proposed Change to Heritage Item	Questions to be addressed	Assessment of the Proposal
Minor partial demolition (including internal elements)	 Is the demolition essential for the heritage item to function? Are important features of the item affected by the demolition? Is the resolution to partially demolish sympathetic to the heritage significance of the item? If the partial demolition is a result of the condition of the fabric, is it certain that the fabric cannot be repaired? 	The Reference Designs demonstrate that modifications (demolition) to the building fabric to allow for its integration into the site-wide development and its adaptive re-use will ensure that a sense of the original/early floor plate and structural grid is retained. The proposed modifications are restricted to fabric that has been modified or is of lesser significance.
Change of use	 Has the advice of a heritage consultant or structural engineer been sought? Has the consultant's advice been implemented? If not, why not? Does the existing use contribute to the significance of the heritage item? Why does the use need to be changed? What changes to the fabric are required as a result of the change of use? What changes to the site are required as a result of the change of use? 	 The potential change of use and guidelines for the adaptive re-use of 19 O'Connell Street have been addressed in the 2022 Conservation Management Plan. The Reference Designs demonstrate that new uses can be introduced into the building which: Are respectful of its significance and do not require major interventions that remove, modify, or obstruct its internal structural grid or its independent identity. Maintain the cultural significance of the place and allow for sympathetic changes to the fabric.
New development adjacent to a heritage item	 How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised? How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects? Is the development sited on any known, or potentially significant archaeological deposits? If so, have alternative sites been considered? Why were they rejected? Is the new development siting, proportions, design)? Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised? 	 The guidelines for the re-development of the Precinct are included in the 2022 Conservation Management Plan including management of the potential Aboriginal and Historical archaeological resource. The Reference Designs demonstrate that: The building's physical integrity and aesthetic contribution to the streetscape will be maintained and enhanced. The perimeter walls, front facade and structural grid will be conserved with missing elements of the front facade reconstructed and/or interpreted. The relationship of new construction (podium and tower) to 19 O'Connell Street will allow the building to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and the public domain and have an active role within the site.

Proposed Change to Heritage Item	Questions to be addressed	Assessment of the Proposal
	 Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance? 	 The architectural resolution of the new podiums on Spring Street and O'Connell Street interpret the original lots and the fine grain of the streetscape and maintain the streetscape presence of 19 O'Connell Street.
		 The streetscape quality of O'Connell Street is enhanced by the new podium.
		 The tower has sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow 19 O'Connell Street to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane.

5.3 Assessment of heritage impact on The Wintergarden 1-15 O'Connell Street

The Proposal does not involve any modifications to the facades of Chatsworth House and the Orient Line building or the low rise corner element of the Wintergarden at the intersection of O'Connell and Bent Streets. This corner has traditionally been defined by built form - in 1905 by the CSR Headquarters building and in 1961 by the Knox Building. The existing corner building defines the street edge at the northern part of the site and was designed intentionally to relate to the Department of Lands and Department of Education buildings in the vicinity.

Also, the Wintergarden site falls within the 'Farrer Place Special Character Area' identified in the Sydney Development Control Plan 2012.



26 Map of 'Farrer Place Special Character Area' Source: Sydney DCP 2012

Character Statement

Historical evidence shows that Farrer Place dates back as early as 1865 mainly being a street. Its original name was Fountain Street as known in 1871 and the name was changed in 1880 to Raphael Street, after the name of an alderman between the 1860s and 70s.

In 1935, the Minister for Agriculture requested that Raphael Street and the triangular plantation space fronting the building housing the Department of Agriculture which, at the time, occupied the southern

wing of the Department of Education, be renamed as "Farrer Place". This was to commemorate William J. Farrer, a noted wheat breeder whose work had incalculable benefit to the wheat growing industry.

The closure of Young Street to traffic formalised the space and gave it the character of a plaza. The place was further enhanced by the development of Governor Macquarie Tower as a major public building, complementing the public and institutional character provided by the Departments of Lands and Education buildings to the west.

The area's location in the heart of the financial core of the city has resulted in large-scale high rise towers, interspersed with lower scale development, mostly with high quality design and elegant rooftops contributing to the skyline of the city. The limited height of the heritage buildings to the north and west allows solar access and provides some visual relief in this highly built up area.

The orientation of the place to the north allows for views to the water and the Harbour Bridge, while the clock tower of the Lands Department building to the west enhances the views from the place and adjoining streets.

Sydney DCP 2012 Principles		Assessment of the Proposal
a)	Development must achieve and satisfy the outcomes expressed in the locality statement and supporting general objectives for special character areas, in addition to the principles below.	 Both Spring and O'Connell Streets are conceived of as a series of buildings, each with a separate, distinct character (rather than a singular architectural language) which helps to anchor the retained heritage
b)	Reinforce the urban character and sense of enclosure of Farrer Place by requiring new buildings to:	fabric in a new context which respects the traditional grain and scale of these buildings.
	<i>i.</i> be built to the street alignment; and	 The retention of the corner element of the Wintergarden preserves this defining corner
	ii. have adequate setbacks above the street alignment.	element. The Chatsworth House and Orient Line
c)	Restrain the building bulk and scale of new development, particularly to the east and south of the place.	building facades are both retained and better integrated into the project and the precinct
d)	Protect and extend winter sun access to the place, particularly during lunchtime.	 The resolution, height and architectural detailing of the Spring Street and O'Connell
e)	Interpret the history of the place and its evolution in the design of new buildings and elements within the public domain and give it its own sense of place.	Street podiums have the potential to enhance the streetscapes of Spring Street and O'Connell Street and the relationship with these remnant facades.
f)	Improve, enhance and activate the public domain within the place.	
g)	Maintain and enhance existing views to Sydney Harbour and the Harbour Bridge to the north and vistas to the tower of the Lands Department building to the west.	

5.4 Assessment of heritage impact on the Radisson Hotel 66 Pitt Street

The following table sets out the assessment of heritage impact of the Proposal on the Radisson Hotel (aka former Sydney Morning Herald Building and Wales House) at 66 Pitt Street using the relevant standard questions in the 1996 HeritageNSW publication: *Statements of Heritage Impact*.

Proposed Change to Heritage Item	Questions to be addressed	Assessment of the Proposal
	 Questions to be addressed How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised? How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects? Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised? Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance? 	O'Connell Street Precinct redevelopment site shares a boundary with the Radisson Hotel (to the south) and has the potential to impact the appreciation of the Radisson Hotel building from the public domain. The building, with its rounded corner treatment on the prominent narrow-vee site provides a good and clearly visible element in the streetscape. The new office tower will be visible directly behind the Radisson Hotel historic corner tower on the corner of Hunter and Pitt Street in long range views down Pitt Street from the south ie Martin Place. In these views it will lose its silhouette profile against the sky. However, in all other public domain views the historic corner tower and the new commercial office tower will be discrete. The Reference Design demonstrates the following strategies to minimise the impact of the redevelopment on the Radisson Hotel by ensuring that its historic tower on the corner of Hunter and Pitt Street retains its legibility and
		 differentiation in views from the public domain: The new commercial tower has sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow the Radisson Hotel to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane. The envelope provides a generous setback (3 metres from the boundary with Radisson Hotel and a minimum set-back of 47 metres from the corner tower element). The architectural design quality and materiality of the new tower with its strong, simple and highly ordered architectural language and simple extruded geometry with chamfered corner will allow the historic corner tower to be differentiated against a contemporary a calm, recessive backdrop when viewed from the south (Martin Place). The height, architectural resolution and detailing of the adjacent podiums on Spring and O'Connell Street will help to differentiate the street walls and tower of the Radisson Hotel.

5.5 Assessment of heritage impact on the adjacent heritage sites

The following table sets out the summary of the heritage impact of the Proposal on the adjacent heritage sites and buildings:

Heritage Item	Assessment of heritage impact of the Proposal
Former Manufacturers House, 12-14 O'Connell Street	These two buildings have a direct visual and architectural relationship with 19 O'Connell Street comprising a group of three surviving interwar era commercial buildings. The architectural resolution and quality of the new podiums on O'Connell Street which interpret the original lots and the fine grain of the streetscape will enhance the streetscape presence of these three buildings. Good views of 12-14 and 16 O'Connell Street will be gained from the new roof terrace of 19 O'Connell Street.
Former Bank of NSW, 16 O'Connell Street	
Former Department of Lands Building	The two sandstone buildings together with Farrer Place and its palm trees make a positive contribution to the public domain fronting Bent and O'Connell Streets. This will be enhanced by the Proposal as the Wintergarden corner is reworked to provide additional open space and landscaped public domain with a contemporary architectural building as a backdrop. The new commercial tower is of sufficient distance from the southern façade of the Lands and Education building to have no real visual impact on them.
Former Department of Education Building	
Palm Trees - Farrer Place	
Australia Square Plaza Building	The new through site link will provide a direct connection to the public domain within Australia Square. The new Spring Street podium with high architectural quality and materials will replace existing commercial buildings. This will enhance the setting of the Plaza Building rather than detract from it. The new commercial tower has sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow the Plaza to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane.
Former Liverpool & London & Globe building	The new Spring Street podium with high architectural quality and materials will replace existing commercial buildings. This will enhance the setting of the Former Liverpool & London & Globe building rather than detract from it.
	The new commercial tower has sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow the Former Liverpool & London & Globe building to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane.

6 CONCLUSIONS

The Reference Designs demonstrate that the Proposal has the potential to avoid, minimise, or mitigate potential adverse impacts on the cultural heritage significance of 19 O'Connell Street and the elements within the development site and the buildings adjoining and immediately adjacent to the development site. It demonstrates good heritage outcomes for the cultural heritage of the City of Sydney.

- 1. 19-21 O'Connell Street is integrated into the new development whilst:
 - providing it with an active role within the site with a new use which does not require major interventions that remove, modify, or obstruct its internal structural grid or its independent identity
 - maintaining and enhancing its aesthetic contribution to the streetscape and its legibility and integrity within the site, streetscape and the public domain
- 2. The relationship of new construction (podium and tower) to 19-21 O'Connell Street will allow the building to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and the public domain:
 - the architectural resolution of the new podium on O'Connell Street enhances the streetscape presence of 19 O'Connell Street.
 - the tower has sufficient horizontal and vertical set back to allow 19 O'Connell Street to maintain its legibility and integrity within the streetscape and in the ground plane.
- 3. The relationship with the remnant façades of Chatsworth House and the Orient Line building is conserved and respected by the resolution, height and architectural detailing of the Spring Street podium to enhance the streetscape of Spring Street.
- 4. The new Spring Street and O'Connell Street podiums with high architectural quality and materials will replace existing commercial buildings and enhance the streetscape character and setting of the adjacent heritage items and make a positive contribution to the public domain.
- 5. The visual relationship of the new tower on the adjoining Radisson Hotel has been respected by ensuring that its historic tower on the corner of Hunter and Pitt Street retains its legibility and differentiation in views from the public domain.